*e*cancermedicalscience

Stigma about palliative care: origins and solutions

Jacqueline Alcalde^{1,2,3} and Camilla Zimmermann^{1,2,3,4}

¹Department of Supportive Care, Princess Margaret Cancer Centre, Toronto M5G 2M9, Canada

²Divisions of Palliative Medicine and Medical Oncology, Department of Medicine, University of Toronto, Toronto M5G 2C1, Canada

³Division of Palliative Care, University Health Network, Toronto M5G 2C1, Canada

⁴Department of Psychiatry, University of Toronto, Toronto M5G 2C1, Canada

Abstract

Despite high-level evidence demonstrating the benefits of integrating palliative care early in the trajectory of advanced cancer, there remains a stigma surrounding this important discipline. This stigma is rooted in the origins of palliative care as care for the dying and is propagated by misinformation and late referrals to palliative care services. Current official definitions of palliative care emphasise the importance of early identification and treatment of symptoms and provision of care concurrently with treatments aimed at improving survival. However, this model of palliative care is neither widely known by patients and their caregivers nor consistently practiced. Herein, we describe changes that are necessary at the levels of practice, policy and public education to shift the status quo. Change requires palliative care teams that are staffed, trained and resourced to accommodate early referrals; education for referring physicians to provide high-quality primary palliative care, as well as timely referral to specialists; and a public health strategy for timely palliative care that educates and engages policymakers, stakeholders and the public. The hospice movement was directed at improving care for the dying; continued expansion of this movement is necessary so that all patients with advanced cancer may benefit from its principles throughout the course of illness.

Keywords: palliative care, cancer, health policy, health education, public health, social stigma

Introduction

Receiving a diagnosis of cancer is itself a fearful experience, but the introduction of 'palliative care' as a treatment option is perhaps equally traumatic. 'Palliative care' is perceived by patients and their caregivers – and often by healthcare providers – as meaning cessation of treatment, lack of hope and imminent death [1]. We argue that this association is rooted in the origins of palliative care in the hospice movement and is propagated by the continued practice of palliative care as end-of-life care, despite evidence that its early integration into cancer care improves quality of life and perhaps also survival. **Correspondence to:** Camilla Zimmermann Email: camilla.zimmermann@uhn.ca

ecancer 2022, 16:1377 https://doi.org/10.3332/ecancer.2022.1377

Published: 28/04/2022 Received: 18/06/2021

Publication costs for this article were supported by ecancer (UK Charity number 1176307).

Copyright: © the authors; licensee ecancermedicalscience. This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License (http:// creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0), which permits unrestricted use, distribution, and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

Origins of palliative care

Palliative care originated in the modern hospice movement in the 1960s. In 1967, Dame Cicely Saunders opened St. Christopher's Hospice in London, where she developed an interdisciplinary model of care for patients approaching the end of life [2]. Saunders challenged the then-prevailing view that lack of an available cure constituted a failure on the part of the physician and considerably improved the standard of end-of-life care by introducing a multidisciplinary approach. Her philosophy drew the attention of clinicians worldwide, among them Dr Balfour Mount, a Canadian urologist, was interested in improving end-of-life care. Inspired by his visit to St. Christopher's in 1973, Dr Mount founded a hospice-style inpatient unit at the Royal Victoria Hospital in Montreal, Canada [3]. As the word 'hospice' had a negative connotation in French, he introduced the term 'palliative care', which is based on the Latin 'palliare' meaning 'to cloak' [3, 4].

Palliative care was formally defined by the World Health Organisation (WHO) [5], as the 'active total care of patients whose disease is not responsive to curative treatment with the goal of achieving best possible quality of life'. However, it soon became clear that this model of care was relevant throughout the course of a serious illness. The WHO [6] redefined palliative care as 'an approach that improves the quality of life of patients and their families facing problems associated with life-threatening illness through the prevention and relief of suffering by means of early identification and impeccable assessment and treatment of pain and other problems, physical, psychosocial and spiritual'. However, the original definition based on end-of-life care has held fast and continues to represent the most commonly practiced model of palliative care [7].

Evidence for the benefit of early palliative care

Although the 2002 WHO definition emphasised early intervention to improve quality of life, definitive evidence for this model of care did not emerge until almost a decade later. In 2010, a randomised controlled trial demonstrated improved quality of life and mood for patients with newly diagnosed advanced non-small cell lung cancer who received early specialised palliative care, compared with those who received standard care [8]. In 2014, a trial involving patients with advanced lung, gastrointestinal, genitourinary, breast and gynaecological cancers demonstrated improvement in quality of life, symptom control and satisfaction with care for patients randomised to early involvement of specialised outpatient palliative care, compared to standard care [9]. Further randomised trials in the United States and Europe reproduced these benefits of early specialised palliative care for patients with cancer; demonstrated benefits of improved mood and satisfaction with care for their caregivers; and showed a significant reduction in aggressive interventions at the end of life [10–13].

Thus, in the last two decades, strong evidence has demonstrated that involving specialised palliative care early in the trajectory of advanced cancer improves multiple outcomes among patients with advanced cancer and their caregivers. Consequently, multiple organisations now recommend early palliative care as a standard of care in advanced cancer; these include the American Society of Clinical Oncology and the European Society of Medical Oncology [14–16].

Patient, caregiver and public perceptions of palliative care

Despite the evidence for the benefit of early palliative care and the endorsement of this model by oncology societies, palliative care carries negative connotations for patients, caregivers and the public [1, 17–20]. In a qualitative study conducted in a Canadian cancer centre, patients and caregivers in the control and intervention groups were interviewed after completion of a 4-month trial of early palliative care versus routine oncology care [1]. In both trial arms, participants stated that before beginning the trial, they associated palliative care with death, hopelessness, dependency and end-of-life care. Similar perceptions were reported in another qualitative study, in which patients were recruited from cancer services at a metropolitan hospital in Australia: patients and caregivers associated the term palliative care with a system of diminished care, diminished possibilities and diminished choice [17].

The Canadian qualitative study described above compared opinions of participants in the control and intervention arms before and after the trial [1]. While participants in the control group did not report a change in their opinions, those who received early specialised palliative care developed a more comprehensive concept of palliative care as 'ongoing care' that improved their 'quality of living'. Despite this positive shift,

Public surveys have also demonstrated a lack of knowledge about palliative care [18–21]. Cross-sectional surveys from a wide range of countries have demonstrated that the public associates palliative care with end-of-life care [18, 19], and a recent Canadian survey revealed a gap in perceived and actual knowledge of palliative care [20]. Of 1,518 survey participants, 45% had a high self-rated knowledge of palliative care, yet less than half of these were aware of important elements of the WHO palliative care definition. Moreover, those who believed they had high knowledge of palliative care were less likely to believe palliative care offered hope than those who believed they had low knowledge; conversely, those with greater actual awareness of the WHO palliative care definition were more likely to believe palliative care offers hope. These surveys underline the importance of public education to decrease stigma about palliative care.

Oncologists' referral practices and perceptions of palliative care

Patients, caregivers and the public have identified experiences within the healthcare system as the main source of their opinions about palliative care [1, 18, 20]. Oncologists tend to refer patients late in the disease course when symptoms are poorly controlled and systemic treatments have been exhausted [7, 21]. Although cancer centres in North America have reported earlier referrals in recent years [22, 23], a similar pattern of earlier referral has not yet been observed in Europe [24].

Physicians' referral practices reflect their attitudes towards palliative care. In surveys and qualitative studies, oncologists expressed ambivalence about the early integration of palliative care [25]. Some physicians associated palliative care with terminal care or with discontinuation of cancer treatment [26–28] or felt that the term palliative care could upset patients or caregivers [29, 30]. Others believed that palliative care specialists could interfere with the cancer care plan by introducing different treatment goals or alternate options for care [25, 27].

Renaming palliative care has been proposed as a solution to late referral. Indeed, surveys have shown that approximately 20%–30% of oncologists would refer patients earlier to outpatient palliative care if its name was changed to 'supportive care' [20, 29]. However, in a cross-sectional study surveying palliative care specialists in Canada, only 20% agreed that the specialty of palliative care should be renamed [31]. Of note, while 90% of these palliative care physicians supported early palliative care referral and had referral criteria in place to facilitate this practice, only 20% received referrals earlier than 6 months before patient death.

Potential solutions

Potential solutions to reduce stigma and increase integration of palliative care must involve a multipronged approach at the levels of individual patients and clinicians, institutions and society. Change must begin with the palliative care team itself: palliative care clinicians generally welcome early consultations but their teams must be sufficiently staffed, trained and resourced to accommodate early referrals [31, 32]. Ideally, a screening mechanism should also be in place so that early palliative care is prioritised for those who need it most [33]. Although there are multiple practice models that integrate palliative care, outpatient clinics represent the main setting for patients to be seen early in the disease trajectory [34]. Other important components of models to improve early palliative care integration are an interdisciplinary team with effective communication and collaboration among care providers, the capacity to respond quickly to patient needs and skill in addressing problems that arise early in the disease course (e.g., complications of cancer treatment and psychological distress) [24, 34, 35]. At the institutional and policy level, teams require sufficient funding to be able to deliver palliative care to patients with a wide range of prognoses [36].

Once a model is in place that can accommodate early palliative care, referring physicians need to feel comfortable explaining and enacting this collaborative model, rather than a 'hand-off' model at the end of life. In this regard, training of oncologists and oncology nurses regarding palliative care referral is essential to dispel myths and misconceptions about palliative care [37–39]. Lectures and clinical rotations in palliative care should be integrated as essential components in the curricula of medicine and nursing schools [40]. Indeed, it has been shown that oncologists who have completed a rotation in palliative care tend to refer patients earlier [21]. On the other hand, palliative care teams cannot and should not provide all palliative care, and it is important for oncologists and primary care providers to have a basic knowledge of palliative care. For clinicians in practice, there are opportunities to pursue continuing medical education as well as formal linkages and mentoring opportunities with tertiary palliative care teams to build and maintain skills in the providing high-quality primary palliative care [16].

In addition to education for healthcare providers, public education is also essential so that the patients and caregivers are aware of the relevance and importance of early, integrated palliative care. Education at a public health level would be enhanced by engaging national leaders, stakeholders and society as stakeholders to develop and enact a public health strategy on palliative care [40, 41]. Potential solutions to inform the public include media campaigns similar to the 'chain of survival' for first aid [42] and didactic palliative care resources directed to patients and caregivers to enhance their knowledge and access to palliative care [43, 44]. These resources could be shared in the form of online materials, short videos or printed pamphlets [45].

Conclusion

Despite strong evidence for the benefit of early palliative care, patients and their caregivers continue to fear palliative care referral and associate it with cessation of treatment and imminent death. The reason for the *status quo* is circular: referrals are made late due to the misperception that palliative care is end-of-life care, and palliative care remains synonymous with end-of-life care due to late referrals. The way out of this circle is to change the policy and practice at multiple levels, and to provide broad-based education about the expanded meaning of palliative care. Only a society that is aware of the benefits of early palliative care can demand that resources be allocated to integrate and prioritise this essential healthcare service.

Conflicts of interest

The authors declare no conflicts of interest.

Funding

Dr Zimmermann is supported by the Harold and Shirley Lederman Chair in Psychosocial Oncology and Palliative Care, held jointly at the Princess Margaret Cancer Centre, University Health Network, and the University of Toronto.

References

- 1. Zimmermann C, Swami N, and Krzyzanowska M, et al (2016) Perceptions of palliative care among patients with advanced cancer and their caregivers CMAJ 188 E217–E227 https://doi.org/10.1503/cmaj.151171 PMID: 27091801 PMCID: 4938707
- 2. Clark D (2007) From margins to centre: a review of the history of palliative care in cancer Lancet Oncol 8 430-438 https://doi.org/10.1016/S1470-2045(07)70138-9 PMID: 17466900
- 3. Duffin J (2014) Palliative care: the oldest profession? Can Bull Med History 31 205-228 https://doi.org/10.3138/cbmh.31.2.205
- 4. Ryan S, Wong J, and Chow R, et al (2020) Evolving definitions of palliative care: upstream migration or confusion? Curr Treat Options Oncol 21 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11864-020-0716-4 PMID: 32048055
- 5. World Health Organization (1990) Cancer pain relief and palliative care : report of a WHO expert committee World Health Organ Tech Rep Ser 804 1–75
- 6. World Health Organization (2002) National Cancer Control Programmes: Policies and Managerial Guidelines 2nd edn (Geneva: World Health Organization)

- 7. Jordan RI, Allsop MJ, and ElMokhallalati Y, et al (2020) Duration of palliative care before death in international routine practice: a systematic review and meta-analysis BMC Med 18 368 https://doi.org/10.1186/s12916-020-01829-x PMID: 33239021 PMCID: 7690105
- Temel JS, Greer JA, and Muzikansky A, et al (2010) Early palliative care for patients with metastatic non-small-cell lung cancer N Engl J Med 363 733–742 https://doi.org/10.1056/NEJMoa1000678 PMID: 20818875
- Zimmermann C, Swami N, and Krzyzanowska, et al (2014) Early palliative care for patients with advanced cancer: a cluster-randomised controlled trial Lancet 383 1721–1730 https://doi.org/10.1016/S0140-6736(13)62416-2 PMID: 24559581
- Gaertner J, Siemens W, and Meerpohl JJ, et al (2017) Effect of specialist palliative care services on quality of life in adults with advanced incurable illness in hospital, hospice, or community settings: systematic review and meta-analysis BMJ 357 PMID: <u>28676557</u> PMCID: 5496011
- Hoerger M, Wayser GR, and Schwing G, et al (2019) Impact of interdisciplinary outpatient specialty palliative care on survival and quality of life in adults with advanced cancer: a meta-analysis of randomized controlled trials Ann Behav Med 53 674–685 <u>https://doi.org/10.1093/abm/kay077</u> PMCID: 6546936
- 12. McDonald J, Swami N, and Hannon B, et al (2017) Impact of early palliative care on caregivers of patients with advanced cancer: cluster randomised trial Ann Oncol 28 163–168 https://doi.org/10.1093/annonc/mdw438
- Alam S, Hannon B, and Zimmermann C (2020) Palliative care for family caregivers J Clin Oncol 38 926–936 <u>https://doi.org/10.1200/</u> JCO.19.00018 PMID: 32023152
- Ferrell BR, Temel JS, and Temin S, et al (2016) Integration of palliative care into standard oncology care: American Society of Clinical Oncology Clinical Practice guideline update J Clin Oncol 35 96–112 <u>https://doi.org/10.1200/JCO.2016.70.1474</u> PMID: <u>28034065</u>
- Jordan K, Aapro M, and Kaasa S, et al (2018) European Society for Medical Oncology (ESMO) position paper on supportive and palliative care Ann Oncol 29 36–43 https://doi.org/10.1093/annonc/mdx757
- Kaasa S, Loge JH, and Aapro M, et al (2018) Integration of oncology and palliative care: a Lancet Oncology Commission Lancet Oncol 19 e588-e653 https://doi.org/10.1016/S1470-2045(18)30415-7 PMID: 30344075
- 17. Collins A, McLachlan SA, and Philip J (2017) Initial perceptions of palliative care: an exploratory qualitative study of patients with advanced cancer and their family caregivers Palliat Med 31 825–832 https://doi.org/10.1177/0269216317696420 PMID: 28367679
- 18. Patel P and Lyons L (2020) Examining the knowledge, awareness, and perceptions of palliative care in the general public over time: a scoping literature review *Am J Hosp Palliat Care* **37** 481–487 https://doi.org/10.1177/1049909119885899
- 19. Grant MS, Back AL, and Dettmar NS (2021) Public perceptions of advance care planning, palliative care, and hospice: a scoping review *J Palliat Med* 24 46–52 https://doi.org/10.1089/jpm.2020.0111
- 20. Zimmermann C, Wong J, and Swami N, et al Knowledge and attitudes concerning palliative care among members of the public BMJ Support Palliat Care (in Press)
- Wentlandt K, Krzyzanowska MK, and Swami N, et al (2012) Referral practices of oncologists to specialized palliative care J Clin Oncol 30 4380–4386 https://doi.org/10.1200/JCO.2012.44.0248 PMID: 23109708
- Hausner D, Tricou C, and Mathews J, et al (2021) Timing of palliative care referral before and after evidence from trials supporting early palliative care Oncologist 26 332–340 https://doi.org/10.1002/onco.13625 PMCID: 8018311
- Hui D, De La Rosa A, and Chen J, et al (2020) State of palliative care services at US cancer centers: an updated national survey Cancer 126 2013–2023 <u>https://doi.org/10.1002/cncr.32738</u> PMID: <u>32049358</u> PMCID: <u>7160033</u>
- Mathews J, Hannon B, and Zimmermann C (2021) Models of integration of specialized palliative care with oncology Curr Treat Options Oncol 22 https://doi.org/10.1007/s11864-021-00836-1 PMID: 33830352 PMCID: 8027976

- 25. Kruser TJ, Kruser JM, and Gross JP, et al (2020) Medical oncologist perspectives on palliative care reveal physician-centered barriers to early integration Ann Palliat Med 9 2800–2808 https://doi.org/10.21037/apm-20-270 PMID: 32787372 PMCID: 7572896
- 26. Sarradon-Eck A, Besle S, and Troian J, et al (2019) Understanding the barriers to introducing early palliative care for patients with advanced cancer: a qualitative study J Palliat Med 22 508–516 https://doi.org/10.1089/jpm.2018.0338 PMID: 30632886
- 27. Charalambous H, Pallis A, and Hasan B, *et al* (2014) Attitudes and referral patterns of lung cancer specialists in Europe to specialized palliative care (SPC) and the practice of early palliative care (EPC) *BMC Palliat Care* **13** 59 <u>https://doi.org/10.1186/1472-684X-13-59</u> PMCID: 4279692
- Buckley de Meritens A, Margolis B, and Blinderman C, et al (2017) Practice patterns, attitudes, and barriers to palliative care consultation by gynecologic oncologists J Oncol Pract 13 e703-e711 https://doi.org/10.1200/JOP.2017.021048 PMID: 28783424 PMCID: 6366809
- 29. Fadul N, Elsayem A, and Palmer JL, *et al* (2009) Supportive versus palliative care: what's in a name?: a survey of medical oncologists and midlevel providers at a comprehensive cancer center Cancer 115 2013–2021 https://doi.org/10.1002/cncr.24206 PMID: 19235253
- Smith CB, Nelson JE, and Berman AR, et al (2012) Lung cancer physicians' referral practices for palliative care consultation Ann Oncol 23 382–387 <u>https://doi.org/10.1093/annonc/mdr345</u>
- 31. Sorensen A, Wentlandt K, and Le LW, et al (2020) Practices and opinions of specialized palliative care physicians regarding early palliative care in oncology Support Care Cancer 28 877–885 https://doi.org/10.1007/s00520-019-04876-0
- 32. Zimmermann C, Ryan S, and Hannon B, et al (2019) Team-based outpatient early palliative care: a complex cancer intervention BMJ Support Palliat Care 0 1–10
- Zimmermann C, Pope A, and Hannon B, et al (2021) Phase II trial of symptom screening with targeted early palliative care (STEP) for patients with advanced cancer J Natl Compr Canc Netw (in Press) https://doi.org/10.6004/jnccn.2020.7803
- 34. Hui D, Hannon BL, and Zimmermann C, et al (2018) Improving patient and caregiver outcomes in oncology: team-based, timely, and targeted palliative care CA Cancer J Clin 5 356–376 https://doi.org/10.3322/caac.21490
- 35. Luckett T, Phillips J, and Agar M, et al (2014) Elements of effective palliative care models: a rapid review BMC Health Serv Res 14 136 https://doi.org/10.1186/1472-6963-14-136 PMID: 24670065 PMCID: 3986907
- 36. Aldridge MD, Hasselaar J, and Garralda E, *et al* (2016) Education, implementation, and policy barriers to greater integration of palliative care: a literature review *Palliat Med* **30** 224–239 https://doi.org/10.1177/0269216315606645
- 37. Harding R, Nair S, and Ekstrand M (2019) Multilevel model of stigma and barriers to cancer palliative care in India: a qualitative study BMJ Open 9 e024248 https://doi.org/10.1136/bmjopen-2018-024248 PMID: 30837250 PMCID: 6429952
- 38. Granek L, Krzyzanowska MK, and Tozer R, et al (2013) Oncologists' strategies and barriers to effective communication about the end of life J Oncol Pract 9 e129–e135 <u>https://doi.org/10.1200/JOP.2012.000800</u> PMID: <u>23942929</u> PMCID: <u>3710179</u>
- 39. Mohammed S, Savage P, and Kevork N, *et al* (2020) "I'm going to push this door open. You can close it": a qualitative study of the brokering work of oncology clinic nurses in introducing early palliative care *Palliat Med* 34 209–218 https://doi.org/10.1177/0269216319883980
- 40. Morrison RS (2018) A national palliative care strategy for Canada J Palliat Med 21 S63–S75 https://doi.org/10.1089/jpm.2017.0431
- 41. Stjernswa J, Edin F, and Foley KM, et al (2007) The public health strategy for palliative care the need for palliative care J Pain Symptom Manage 33 486–493 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jpainsymman.2007.02.016
- 42. Bollig G, Brandt F, and Ciurlionis M, et al (2019) Last aid course. An education for all citizens and an ingredient of compassionate communities Healthcare (Basel, Switzerland) 7 1–12

- 43. Graul A, Haggerty A, and Stickley C, *et al* (2020) Effect of patient education on palliative care knowledge and acceptability of outpatient palliative care services among gynecologic oncology patients: a randomized controlled trial *Gynecol Oncol* **156** 482–487 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ygyno.2019.11.023</u>
- 44. Kozlov E, Reid MC, and Carpenter BD (2017) Improving patient knowledge of palliative care: a randomized controlled intervention study *Patient Educ Counsel* 100 1007–1011 https://doi.org/10.1016/j.pec.2016.12.022
- 45. Prabhu AV, Crihalmeanu T, and Hansberry DR, *et al* (2017) Online palliative care and oncology patient education resources through Google: do they meet national health literacy recommendations? *Pract Radiat Oncol* **7** 306–310 <u>https://doi.org/10.1016/j.prro.2017.01.013</u> PMID: 28341318